

**Florida National Register Review Board  
R. A. Gray Building, Room 307  
Tallahassee, Florida  
August 4, 2022  
Meeting Minutes**

**Commission Members Present via Webinar:** Dr. J. Michael Francis; Dr. Clifford Smith, Jr.

**Commission Member Not Present:** Ms. Kathleen Kauffman, Vice Chair

**Commission Members Present In-Person:** Dr. Judith Bense; Mr. Rick Gonzalez, Chair

**Florida Department of State Officials and Staff Present In-Person:** Mr. Michael Hart, Historic Marker Coordinator; Mr. Ruben Acosta, Survey and Registration Supervisor; Mr. Andrew Waber, Historic Preservationist; Ms. Alissa Lotane, Division Director; Ms. Annie Delaroderie, Historic Preservationist; Ms. Kelly Chase, Compliance Supervisor; Ms. Harley Burgis, Grant Specialist.

**Florida Department of State Officials and Staff Present via Webinar:** Mr. Eric Case, Grants Supervisor; Mr. Michael DuBose, Compliance Specialist; Mr. John Grandage, Director of Public Engagement & Historic Site Development; Ms. Jennifer Tobias, Compliance Specialist; Mr. Daniel Velasquez, Compliance Specialist; Ms. Marcia Welch, Compliance Specialist.

**Guests Present In-Person:** Ms. Misty Bryd, Owner of Panacea Springs; Ms. Quincee Messersmith, Head of Wakulla County Board of County Commissioners; Ms. Sherrie Miller, Owner of Posey's Steam Room in Panacea.

**Guests Present via Webinar:** Ms. Dornecia Allen, Ms. Kohn Evans, Oak Hill City Administrator; Ms. Dana Greatrex, Mr. Robert Mills, Ms. Theresa Murtha, Mr. Tyler Patak.

**I. Call to Order and Roll Call**

Mr. Michael Hart read the housekeeping notes addressing the webinar. Mr. Rick Gonzalez called the meeting to order at 1:35 pm. He asked Mr. Acosta to call the roll.

**II. Introduction of Commission, Staff, and Guests**

Mr. Acosta introduced the staff. Mr. Hart introduced members of the staff and guests on the webinar. Mr. Gonzalez introduced the Commission.

**III. Adoption of Agenda**

Mr. Gonzalez asked for an adaption of the agenda. Dr. Bense moved to adopt the agenda. Dr. Francis seconded the motion. The agenda was approved unanimously.

**IV. Remarks by Chairperson on Purpose of Meeting**

Mr. Gonzalez explained the purpose of the National Register meeting.

V. **Approval of Minutes from the May 19, 2022 Meeting**

Mr. Gonzalez asked for approval of the Meeting Minutes. Dr. Smith made a motion to approve the Minutes from the May National Register Board meeting. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

VI. **Director's Comments**

Ms. Alissa Lotane thanked guests and staff for the congratulations on her new position. She explained the reason for the shorter agenda is due to the large number of county surveys that staff are reviewing.

VII. **Review of Nomination Proposals**

A. **St. Matthews Methodist Episcopal Church, Jacksonville, Duval Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff proposes the St. Matthews Methodist Episcopal Church (MEC) for listing in the National Register under Criterion C for Architecture at the local level. The period of significance extends from circa 1903, its original date of construction, to 1945, when the brick-clad concrete block façade was added onto the front elevation. This building contributes to the *African American Architects in Segregated Jacksonville, 1865-1969 MPS* under Associated Context: African American Architects in Segregated Jacksonville, 1865-1965 and Associated Property Type F.2: Religious Properties.

St. Matthews MEC is one of just four historic churches remaining from the original LaVilla neighborhood and one of just two located east of Interstate 95. This church is an excellent example of the restrained Gothic Revival architecture that was ubiquitous among mid-20<sup>th</sup> century African American church buildings. This is perhaps best expressed through its two prominent towers on the main façade, crenellations, and the lancet arches above the main entrance. The church also represents the work of local master builder James Hutchins, who was called out in the *African American Architects in Segregated Jacksonville MPS* specifically for his work on religious buildings. Like many other African American churches, the original building and 1945 additions were likely built by members of the congregation. As they often operated under constrained financial circumstances, the restrained Gothic Revival elements were added as cost effective measures of bringing a degree of architectural embellishment to the buildings.

It is a one-story wood frame building with brick cladding designed as a vernacular interpretation of the Gothic Revival Style. The main façade is concrete block with brick cladding. The T-shaped building is faced primarily with red brick. The main (south) façade along West Monroe Street features a false front façade with gabled raised parapet and round attic vents framed by two towers. The interior features a sanctuary space used for church services, along with a conference room and bathroom spaces. The precise date of the building's original construction is unclear, but it predates World War I. The church assumed its current appearance in 1945, when it underwent an extensive redesign. In addition to the brick façade, the congregation also expanded the footprint to the east.

Staff would like to draw your attention to a number of changes that occurred to the building since 1945. Originally, when the concrete block façade was added, the rest of the building remained exposed wood siding. Sometime after 1953, the rest of the building was faced with

red brick. Although this is a marked change, the most significant aspect of the exterior, which are the Gothic towers on the main façade, the building's form, the roof form, and the window configurations are retained and reflect its mid-20<sup>th</sup> century appearance. The interior of the building has been altered as well, with non-historic materials added that obscure the historic fabric underneath. Despite this, the building retains most of its historic materials as well as its spatial integrity.

The setting has also been severely impacted. Aside from the adjacent concrete block boarding house, there is too much non-historic infill and vacant lots to visually tie the church to the remnants of historic LaVilla. It is not far, however, from one of the few concentrations of historic LaVilla buildings located at the corner of West Duval Street and North Jefferson Street. The extenuating circumstances of urban renewal and scarcity of this resource must be considered. While setting is affected, it does not render the property ineligible for listing.

Staff therefore finds that St. Matthews Methodist Episcopal Church is eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion C: Architecture, at the local level of significance, for the period 1903 to 1945.

Mr. Gonzalez commented that the façade correlates to a James Huthchins design. He said that the other sides have a vernacular appearance.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited comments from the board. Dr. Francis said that the last few National Register meetings have had properties from rough areas. Dr. Francis asked if this is the only extant building designed by James Hutchins. Mr. Waber said no, there are additional buildings mentioned on page 20 of the nomination. Dr. Francis asked about alterations to the church and questioned why several circa dates were used. Mr. Waber explained that Bishop Leonard helped put the nomination together. Dr. Smith asked if the building façade dates to 1945.

Mr. Acosta said yes, the façade dates to 1945, while the building was built in about 1903.

Mr. Waber said if we want to change the period of significance to 1945, we can do that.

Mr. Gonzalez said he likes noting that the building was built in 1903. Dr. Smith believes the church reads as a 1945 building. Mr. Gonzalez said that the historic features can be put back.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited public comment. No members from the public spoke on this nomination.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Francis made a motion to forward the nomination of the St. Matthews Church to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria C in the area of Architecture, for the period of 1903 to 1945, at the local level of significance. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The nomination passed unanimously.**

**B. Village Improvement Hall, Oak Hill, Volusia Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff proposes the Village Improvement Association Hall, located in Oak Hill, for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Oak Hill is a small town on the east coast of Florida, located south of New Smyrna Beach and north of Cape Canaveral. The Village Improvement Association (VIA) Hall is the oldest and only public building for community use, in Oak Hill. The VIA Hall was built in 1906, along US Highway 1. In 1915, citizens moved the building closer to the center of town and located the building on Halifax Avenue, one block east of US Highway 1. This building

is a one-story wood frame octagonal building, with a one-story rectangular wing on the back side. This building has simple drop siding on all sides.

The Village Improvement Association Hall is being proposed for listing at the local level under Criteria A: Government, for the Period of Significance 1915 to 1965. Both of Oak Hill's City Charters from 1927 and 1962 were written in the VIA Hall. This building served as the city's "Town Hall" building until the new City Hall was built in 1965.

The VIA Hall is also being proposed for listing under Criteria A: Social History, for the Period of Significance 1915 to 1972. The VIA Hall was also built as a community building for people of all ages. The building has had temporary uses as a school, general store, and place where different organizations held events. From 1943 to 1970, Oak Hill's Library was located in the VIA Hall. This building remains a community resource and important building for local citizens.

The VIA Hall is also being proposed for listing under Criteria C: Architecture, with the significant date of 1906, the year the building was constructed. The VIA Hall is an excellent example of a one-story octagon building. Octagon Buildings were constructed during the mid- to late nineteenth century and were uncommon in the southeast. Most octagon buildings are two to three stories, making this symmetrically sided one-story octagon building rare. Although the architect of this building is unknown, the VIA Hall is very good example of the Octagon Style. Several features of the Octagon Style on the VIA Hall include the eight symmetrical sides, windows on each elevation, front porch, and exposed eaves.

The VIA Hall is in great condition and retains much of its early appearance. Constructed in 1906, the VIA Hall retains integrity of setting, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. Although the building was moved several years after its construction, the current location retains the same setting as the original location. The setting around the VIA Hall remains a mix of commercial businesses and small residential lots. The design and materials of the VIA Hall have been preserved through constant maintenance and recent preservation projects. The wood framing on the interior of the VIA Hall has been preserved and remains in good condition. The feeling and association for the building remain intact as this building has always been important to the community and the building's exterior looks the same as in historic photographs.

Staff finds that the Village Improvement Association Hall is eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion A: Government, Criterion A: Social History, and Criterion C: Architecture, at the local level of significance, for the combined period 1915-1972.

Mr. Gonzalez asked about the alteration of the front porch. Ms. Delaroderie commented that we do not know when the front porch was added.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited public comment. No additional public comment was made.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited comments from the board. Dr. Smith thought this is a wonderful building, retaining much of its original fabric. Dr. Francis said it is a great building. He had a stylistic question about Octagon or Octagonal Style. He questioned if the Post Office is also a public building. Ms. Delaroderie explained that yes, the Post Office is a publicly owned building, while the VIA Hall is open to various community uses for all ages.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Francis made a motion to forward the nomination of the Village Improvement Association Hall to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A in the areas of Government and Social History and Criteria C in the area of Architecture, for the period of 1915 to 1972 at the local level of significance. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The nomination passed unanimously.**

**C. Panacea Mineral Springs, Panacea, Wakulla Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff is proposing the Panacea Mineral Springs for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Panacea Mineral Springs is a small property which was first discovered in 1894. The property was popular throughout the twentieth century for the healing mineral water and as a social destination. Panacea is about thirty miles southwest of Tallahassee. Six springs remain on the property, while articles describe that there were originally twenty springs, each with different healing properties. The property boundary encompasses a portion of a larger parcel of land which measures twenty-two acres, but which is primarily forested. The majority of the property is wooded and extends over the stream on the west side of the property. The entire property is twenty-two acres, but we are only nominating the five acres that are cleared on the east side of the property. The nominated portion of the Panacea Mineral Springs property encompasses the six identified historic springs, their associated structures, and a portion of the nearby creek, which were all associated with the historic mineral springs.

Panacea Mineral Springs is being proposed for listing at the local level under Criteria A: Exploration/Settlement for the Period of Significance 1894 to 1895. The town of Panacea Springs was founded around the spring. At some point, the town name was shortened to Panacea. Settlers believed this was a good area due to the coastal location for fishing and the vicinity to the mineral springs.

The Panacea Mineral Springs is also being nominated under Criteria A: Entertainment/Recreation and Health/Medicine for the Period of Significance 1894 to 1972. This Period of Significance corresponds to the springs' founding and the fifty-year cut-off. During the early 1920s, hotels with many amenities were built by the springs to attract vacationers. Although one hotel burned in the 1930s, and another one was destroyed in the 1950s, people continued spending time at the springs through the 1970s. For several decades, locals, people from Tallahassee, Georgia and other states visited the Panacea Mineral Springs for the potential healing benefits from the mineral water. During the late 1920s, entrepreneurial developers began selling bottles of water from the mineral springs. The Panacea Mineral Springs are the most significant resource associated with Panacea's early history that are still extant.

Panacea Mineral Springs retains integrity of location, setting, design, feeling, and association. Although the springs are not in great condition, the six remaining springs are all intact. The springs maintain their original location, along the main road through Panacea. The springs' location allowed them to be easily reached by visitors to Panacea and generated interest from people passing through the town. The design of the springs is as many people remember them from the 1930s and 1940s, although the structures surrounding the springs have changed through time. The Panacea Springs retain the feeling and association and are intact remnants of the original site which attracted early settlers to the area.

Staff finds that Panacea Mineral Springs is eligible for listing in the National Register under Criterion A: Exploration/Settlement and Criterion A: Entertainment/Recreation, at the local level of significance, for the combined period of 1894-1972.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited public comment. Ms. Misty Bryd, the property owner, stated that she acquired the Panacea Mineral Springs in 2020. She has worked to maintain the property, clearing dead pine trees and pine needles. Ms. Sherrie Miller has worked for years trying to get grants for Panacea Springs. She said the Bryd Family has been wonderful to work with and it is great to see the property getting maintained.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited Board comment. Dr. Bense said she loved doing archaeology in Panacea in the 1960s. Dr. Smith said the Panacea Springs is an interesting property and he supports the nomination.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited for additional public comment. No addition comments were made.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Smith made a Motion to forward the nomination of the Panacea Mineral Springs to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A in the areas of Exploration/Settlement, Health/Medicine, and Entertainment/Recreation, for the period of 1894 to 1972, at the local level of significance. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The nomination passed unanimously.**

#### VIII. Relisting Request

##### A. A.C. Freeman House, Punta Gorda, Charlotte Co. was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff is proposing the A. C. Freeman House for relisting in the National Register. The A.C. Freeman House was originally listed in the National Register on January 7, 1987, under Criterion B: Politics for its association with Mayor A.C. Freeman and Criterion C: Architecture for its significant Queen Anne design. The property is being proposed for relisting in the National Register as it was relocated in 2005 from its original location at Hargreaves Avenue and Booth Street to a new lot near downtown located at West Retta Esplanada and Tamiami Trail. The relocation was not pre-approved by the National Park Service, and therefore the property should have been delisted under the provisions found in 36 CFR 60.14 (b), which guide the relocation of listed properties (you can view the CFR here: [ecfr.gov/current/title-36/chapter-1/part-60/section-60.14](https://ecfr.gov/current/title-36/chapter-1/part-60/section-60.14)).

The National Park Service has outlined the process for relisting a relocated property in 36 CFR 60.14 and in *National Register Bulletin 16A: How to Complete the National Register Registration Form*, page 72 ([nps.gov/subjects/nationalregister/upload/NRB16A-Complete.pdf](https://nps.gov/subjects/nationalregister/upload/NRB16A-Complete.pdf)). To summarize, those seeking to relist a property must:

- Submit a request to delist the property, which acknowledges the relocation without prior authorization.
- Submit a new nomination to relist the property. The new nomination must address the required information stipulated in 36 CFR 60.14 (b) and it must evaluate the property under Criteria Consideration B: Moved Properties. See *National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation* for more information on

Criteria Consideration B: [nps.gov/subjects/nationalregister/upload/NRB-15\\_web508.pdf](https://www.nps.gov/subjects/nationalregister/upload/NRB-15_web508.pdf).

- The new nomination should
  - Describe the relocation and analyze its impact upon the building's integrity
  - State how the new location relates to the original location
  - Address how the building retains its historical significance despite the relocation

The submitted relisting request includes a request to delist and a new nomination which expands upon the original National Register nomination for the A.C. Freeman House. This includes a more detailed narrative description, which addresses the relocation, along with an expanded statement of significance. The original nomination was representative of its time and contained only the most basic information for both sections.

Staff would like to highlight that at the time of the original listing in 1987, the house had already been moved once before, approximately two blocks south from its original location. It retained its significance under Criterion B due to the building remaining within the city limits of Punta Gorda. It retained its integrity of setting, association, and feeling. In addition, Criterion C significance can stand independent of location, as the property is evaluated primarily as an object and the most significant aspects of integrity are design, materials, and workmanship. The same is true for the 2005 relocation from the corner of Hargreaves Ave and Booth Street to its current location on West Retta Esplanade. Lastly, the new location is technically within an already listed National Register Historic District, the Punta Gorda Residential Historic District.

Despite the relocation and the necessary edits to the final nomination document, staff finds that the A.C. Freeman House is eligible for re-listing in the National Register under Criterion B: Politics and Criterion C: Architecture, at the local level of significance, for the period 1903-1904.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited board comment. Dr. Smith said the architecture is superb. It is in great condition considering it was moved twice. He thought it still has association with A.C Freeman. Mr. Gonzalez said the house is in great condition. He commented that the porch columns are very thin. Dr. Francis agrees with the other board members.

Mr. Gonzalez solicited public comments. Dr. Tyler Patak worked with the City of Punta Gorda for the nomination. He explained A.C Freeman is considered the local hero for the area. The City took it upon themselves to maintain the house and worked to save it. He said a funeral home was in the second location. The building was previously used by the Chamber of Commerce. There are plans for the city to use the first floor as a welcome center.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion on the delisting. **Dr. Francis moved to forward the nomination of the A.C. Freeman House to the National Park Service for delisting in the National Register of Historic Places, due to the building's different moves. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The delisting passed unanimously.**

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion for the relisting. **Dr. Smith moved to forward the nomination of the A.C. Freeman House to the National Park Service for relisting in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria B and Criteria C in the area of Architecture. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The nomination passed unanimously.**

IX. **Delisting Request**

A. **Buckman and Ulmer Building, Jacksonville, Duval Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff proposes delisting this property from the National Register. This property was demolished to build the current Duval County Library in Jacksonville. It therefore no longer retains integrity and is therefore ineligible for listing in the National Register. Staff therefore finds that the Buckman and Ullmer Building should be removed from the National Register.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Bense moved to forward the nomination of the Buckman and Ulmer Building to the National Park Service for delisting in the National Register of Historic Places, due to the building's demolition. Dr. Smith seconded the motion. The delisting passed unanimously.**

B. **Catherine Street Fire Station, Jacksonville, Duval Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff proposes delisting this property from the National Register. The City of Jacksonville is relocating this property to a new site at 620 East Bay Street as part of the Met Park redevelopment. The locally designated fire station's relocation was approved with a COA from the City of Jacksonville Historic Preservation Commission. The current location is temporary until site work at its future permanent site is completed. As this relocation was carried out without prior approval from the National Park Service, we are required to delist the property under 36 CFR 60.14. However, the fire station is eligible for relisting, in a similar manner to the A.C. Freeman House in Punta Gorda. Once the fire station has been relocated for the final time, staff will work with the City of Jacksonville to complete the relisting process.

Note the Fire Station was previously relocated in the 1990s. Originally listed in the National Register in 1972, NPS approved a relocation of the station to Metropolitan Park in 1992. The relocation was completed in 1994 and the NR nomination for the property was updated that year.

As the property is no longer in the location as listed in 1994 and as the relocation earlier this year was not preapproved by NPS, staff finds that the Catherine Street Fire Station is no longer eligible for listing under the provisions found in 36 CFR 60.14 and therefore should be delisted from the National Register. However, staff also finds that the station would retain sufficient integrity to be relisted in the future once the current relocation is completed and the building is at a new permanent site.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Francis moved to forward the nomination of the Catherine Street Fire Station to the National Park Service for delisting in the National Register of Historic Places, due to the building's different moves. Dr. Bense seconded the motion. The delisting passed unanimously.**



- C. **South Atlantic Investment Corporation Building, Jacksonville, Duval Co.** was presented by Mr. Acosta.

Staff proposes delisting this property from the National Register. This property was demolished to build the current Duval County Library in Jacksonville. It therefore no longer retains integrity and is therefore ineligible for listing in the National Register. Staff therefore finds that the South Atlantic Investment Corporation Building should be removed from the National Register.

Mr. Gonzalez called for a motion. **Dr. Bense moved to forward the nomination of the South Atlantic Investment Corporation Building to the National Park Service for delisting in the National Register of Historic Places, due to the building’s demolition. Dr. Smith seconded the motion. The delisting passed unanimously.**

- X. **Other Business**

Mr. Acosta provided updates on recent National Register listings from the August 2022 Review Board Meeting. Mr. Acosta mentioned that he is now managing the Certified Local Government position, in addition to managing the Survey and Registration section. The next National Register Board Meeting will be Thursday, November 10, 2022.

Dr. Francis asked about the voting sheet for Delisting properties. Mr. Acosta said to write under documentation that the sufficient information was included. Mr. Acosta said that he appreciates comments on National Register nominations.

Dr. Bense asked to clarify why the Catherine Street Fire Station is being delisted. Mr. Acosta said the building did not receive authorization for its move.

- XI. **Public Comment**

None.

- XII. **Motion to Adjourn**

Mr. Gonzalez asked for a motion to adjourn. Dr. Smith called the meeting to adjourn at 3:20 pm.

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Chair, National Register Review Board**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Date**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**State Historic Preservation Officer**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Date**